

# **OFFICE OF THE DIRECTOR OF EQUALITY INVESTIGATIONS**

3 Clonmel Street  
Dublin 2.

Phone: 353 -1- 4173300  
Fax: 353-1- 4173399

E-mail: info@odei.ie  
Website: www.odei.ie

## **ANTI - DISCRIMINATION PAY ACT, 1974**

### **EQUALITY OFFICER'S RECOMMENDATION NO: EP 01/2000**

**Five Named Female Employees  
(Represented by SIPTU)**

**AND**

**Schering Plough (Bray) Limited  
(Represented by IBEC)**

**File No. EP 05/1999  
Date of Issue: 06/01/00**

**1. DISPUTE**

**1.1** This dispute concerns a claim by S.I.P.T.U., on behalf of five named female employees, that they are entitled to the same rate of remuneration as that paid by Schering Plough (Bray) Limited to four named male comparators in terms of Sections 3(a), 3(b) and 3(c) of the Anti-Discrimination (Pay) Act, 1974. Details of the claimants and the comparators are set out in Appendix A.

**2. BACKGROUND**

**2.1** The Company is engaged in the manufacture of animal drugs. The five named female claimants are employed as Filling Operators in the Sterile area. The four named male comparators are employed by the Company as Process Operators. The claimants contend that they perform 'like work' with that performed by the named male comparators. The Company does not accept this contention and it argues that there are 'grounds other than sex' to justify the higher rate of pay to the male comparators.

**2.2** On 22nd February, 1999 the Union, on behalf of the five female claimants, submitted a claim under Section 3(a), Section 3(b) and Section 3(c) of the Anti-Discrimination (Pay) Act, 1974 to an Equality Officer for investigation and recommendation.

**3. SUMMARY OF SUBMISSIONS RECEIVED**

**3.1** The details of the Union's submission is reproduced in Appendix B.

**3.2** According to the Company the claimants in this claim are employed as Filling Operators in the Sterile area and can be required to work as Packaging Operatives as the need arises. They are paid £210.17 per week and are also in receipt of a weekly allowance of £14.00 for 'gowning up' when working in the Sterile area. The male comparators are employed as Process Operators earning a rate of pay of £282.32 per week. The Company contests that 'like work', as defined by Sections 3(a), 3(b) and 3(c) of the 1974 Pay Act, exists between the jobs of the claimants and the named male comparators. The Company also contends

that there are grounds other than sex for the higher rate of pay to the named male comparators.

- 3.3** The Company argues that the jobs of the claimants and the named male comparators do not involve the 'same work' as defined by Section 3(a) of the 1974 Pay Act. It says that the differences between the jobs are occurring on a continuous basis and that no interchangeability whatsoever takes place between the jobs. The claimants and the named male comparators work in different locations, according to the Company, and carry out different functions all the time.
- 3.4** The Company rejects the Union's claim that 'like work' in terms of Section 3(b) of the 1974 Pay Act exists between the claimants and the named male comparators. The Company says that the claimant's job is a machine attending job and requires that the final product be provided to the packaging area in a timely manner. The machine is in effect assembling the various components that go to the final product. The Company says that there is no involvement in the manufacture of any components. By comparison the job of the named male comparators involves the making of tablets, creams, suspensions, liquids, boli, powders and gels from raw ingredients. It also involves the assembly and disassembly of equipment which is not required of the claimants.
- 3.5** In terms of Section 3(c) of the 1974 Pay Act the Company contends that the job of the named male comparators is significantly more demanding in terms of skill, physical effort, mental effort, responsibility and working conditions when compared to the job of the claimants. The Company sets out its arguments under each of these headings in detail and this is attached as Appendix C to this document.
- 3.6** The Company contends that there are 'grounds other than sex' in terms of Section 2(3) of the 1974 Pay Act to justify the higher level of remuneration of the comparators. It says that, whilst not all of the comparators are fully trained in the job of Process Operator, they are paid the full rate for the job from their date of appointment. This is the Company's policy agreed with the Union (S.I.P.T.U.) and this policy applies to all jobs in the Company.

#### **4. CONCLUSIONS OF THE EQUALITY OFFICER**

- 4.1** In making a decision in this claim I have taken into consideration all of the submissions, both oral and in writing, made by both parties. I have also taken into account the work inspections I have undertaken on the work of each of the claimants and each of the named male comparators. Details of the claimants and the male comparators along with their rates of pay are set out in Appendix A. Detailed job descriptions for the claimants are attached as Appendix D and for the named male comparators as Appendix E.
- 4.2** At the hearing of this claim the Union argued that it was claiming equal pay for the claimants with the named male comparators when the male comparators were employed on the PRB Process. The respondent argued that the named male comparators were recruited as Process Operators and as such have to perform all the duties associated with the job of Process Operator including the PRB Process. According to the Union the PRB Process takes place over a period of approximately eight months in the year. The respondent said that not all of the named male comparators would actually spend the full eight months doing this task given that the task was undertaken by two operators at any one time. The Labour Court in the case of Rangeland Meats Limited and S.I.P.T.U.<sup>1</sup> held that “*when conducting an examination to find whether or not a claimant and comparator do work of equal value within the meaning of Section 3(c) of the Act, the totality of the duties undertaken by the claimant and the comparator must be examined*”. In undertaking my investigation I have taken into account all of the tasks which each of the named male comparators undertake as part of their jobs as Process Operators and I have compared their work to the totality of the work undertaken by the claimants.
- 4.3** Section 3(a) of the Anti-Discrimination (Pay) Act, 1974 states that two persons shall be regarded as employed on like work where:

*“both perform the same work under the same or similar conditions, or where each is in every respect interchangeable with the other in relation to the work”.*

---

In this claim all the claimants (with one exception) are employed as Machine Filling Operators in the Sterile Area while the comparators are employed as Process Operators. The exception is employed as a Line Service Operator. From my work inspections I am satisfied that the claimants operate machines which fill syringes, vials, etc whereas the named male comparators are required to make tablets, creams, boli, etc from raw material. The named male comparators must have the ability to operate a greater range of machinery and equipment than the claimants. Furthermore the claimants and the named male comparators are not interchangeable with each other in every respect in relation to their work.

- 4.4** Section 3(b) of the 1974 Pay Act states that two persons shall be regarded as employed on like work where:

*“the work performed by one is of a similar nature to that performed by the other and any differences between the work performed or the conditions under which it is performed by each occur only infrequently or are of small importance in relation to the work as a whole”.*

Having examined the work of the claimants and the named male comparators in detail I am satisfied that their work is not of a similar nature. The reasons for this are apparent from my analysis of the jobs which are set out in Appendices F and G.

- 4.5** Section 3(c) of the 1974 Act states that two persons shall be regarded as being employed on like work where:

*“the work performed by one is equal in value to that performed by the other in terms of the demands it makes in relation to such matters as skill, physical or mental effort, responsibility and working conditions”.*

In examining the claim under Section 3(c) of the Act I have taken account of every aspect of the work performed by the claimants and the named male comparators in relation to skill, physical and mental effort, responsibility and working conditions. Each of the claimants with the exception of one (Ms. E. Crawford) are employed as filling operators and for an examination of their work I have selected one claimant namely Ms. Pauline Doyle for this purpose. The details of my analysis of the work performed by Ms. Doyle and Ms.

Crawford in relation to the work performed by each of the named male comparators are set out in Appendices F and G respectively.

**4.6** From my analysis I find that the demands made on the named male comparators are greater than those made on Ms. Doyle and Ms. Crawford in terms of skill, physical effort, mental effort and responsibility. I find that the demands made on Ms. Doyle, in terms of working conditions are higher than those made on the named male comparators. The demands made on both Ms. Crawford and the named male comparators, in terms of working conditions, are equal. I, therefore, find that 'like work' does not exist between the work performed by the claimants (Ms. Doyle and Ms. Crawford) and each of the named male comparators. As I have found that 'like work' does not exist between Ms. Doyle and each of the named male comparators it follows that 'like work' does not exist between the other claimants and each of the named male comparators. Finally, as I have found that 'like work' does not exist between the claimants and each of the named male comparators it is not necessary for me to consider the arguments made by the Company in relation to 'grounds other than sex' under Section 2(3) of the Act.

**4.7** From my examination of the work of the claimants and that of the named male comparators when they are working solely on the PRB Assembly I am satisfied that 'like work' does not exist as alleged by the Union.

## **5. RECOMMENDATION**

**5.1** In view of my foregoing conclusions that the five named female claimants do not perform 'like work' with that performed by each of the named male comparators in terms of Section 3 of the Anti-Discrimination (Pay) Act, 1974 I find that they do not have any entitlement to the same rate of remuneration as that paid by Schering Plough (Bray) Limited to each of the four named male comparators.

---

Gerardine Coyle

Equality Officer

6th January, 2000

**APPENDIX A**

**List of Claimants  
and  
Comparators**

**Claimants:**

Ms. Pauline Doyle

Ms. Elaine Cromwell

Ms. Liz Layton

Ms. Elaine Crawford

Ms. Catherine Coughlan

The claimants are employed as Filling Operators in the Sterile area. They are paid £210.17 per week. In addition they are also in receipt of a weekly allowance of £14.00 for “gowning up” when working in the Sterile area.

**Comparators:**

Mr. Philip Byrne

Mr. Steven Hayden

Mr. Warren Neill

Mr. Martin Reilly

The comparators are employed as Process Operators and are paid £282.32 per week.

**APPENDIX B**

**Union's Submission**

**P.R.B. MACHINE OPERATORS PHASE 2  
COMPARED TO  
STERILE MANUFACTURING AREA MACHINE OPERATORS PHASE 1.**

The P.R.B. Machines run approximately 8 months of the year compared to that of the Sterile Manufacturing Area which run all year round. The P.R.B. machines are operated by one person like the Arencos's.

Both Phase 1 and Phase 2 operators have line service personnel who supply the operators with the components required to run the machines.

The P.R.B. boli are in tablet form whereas in the Sterile Manufacturing Area the product is in liquid form.

In theory both machines are operated in the same manner i.e. the machines are monitored and the operators are responsible for the end product.

Unlike Phase 1 the P.R.B. Machines do not require a sterile area and the operators do not have any responsibility with regard to sterility and sterile gowning procedures.

When the P.R.B. Machines were originally installed female employees on packaging wages operated them. When the male employees started operating the P.R.B. machines their wages were increased and new job titles were given. P.R.B. operators need only wear ordinary overalls, whereas the Sterile operator must gown in a special undersuit, and irradiated oversuit, hood, boots and mask. These restrictions limit access to the facilities within the factory, i.e. drinking water, toilets and radio.

## **STERILE MANUFACTURING AREA: PHASE 1**

There are three Arenco machines in the Sterile Manufacturing Area which run all year round, but on a regular basis the Coprin UK machine runs and periodically four other machines Coprin NZ, Lexin (powder), eye ointment and MV Genta operate. The operators may have to operator these machines depending on the circumstances i.e. the availability of people.

A manufacturing process operator works in the Sterile Manufacturing Area on a full time basis, the product is manufactured between the Manufacturing Area and the Sterile Manufacturing Area, this leaves the machine operators exposed to dust from powers, smells and higher noise levels.

When the process operator is unavailable in the Sterile Manufacturing Area the machine operators would oblige the process operators in manufacturing by emptying the autoclave and LTE oven, connecting pipe work and removing pallets from the airlock.



## **PHASE 1 STERILE MANUFACTURING AREA**

### **Service:**

All full time operators in the sterile area have service records of ten to twelve years, two of these operators were originally employed as operators. The others started with the company as packaging operators but are in the sterile area between five to nine years.

### **LINE SERVICE (Job Description) (Elaine Crawford)**

Making of disinfecting solutions every morning.

Description labelling and washing of bottles every morning.

Supplying components to all operating lines.

Making sure that the Sterile Manufacturing Area is fully supplied with all equipment needed e.g. pens, markers and paperwork. These supplies are obtained from the consumable stores on a twice-weekly basis and are prepared and sent out for irradiation before they are allowed into the area.

Filling in at some point during each day on all machines for operators who are absent, on training exercises, or when short staffed.

In the afternoons dirty laundry must be removed from the bins in both male and female changing rooms and brought to the warehouse, the clean laundry is brought back to the Sterile Manufacturing changing room and stored away.

Disinfecting of both changing rooms is performed four times a day for both sterile and manufacturing areas.

The wash area and changing areas must be kept tidy at all times by line service.



**Procedures:**

Unlike Phase 2 the Sterile Manufacturing Area has high standards of sterility to follow this puts a huge amount of responsibility on the operators.

It is up to the machine operators to ensure the finished product is of the highest standard and must not be contaminated in any way.

To ensure this quality the sterile operator must first undress and gown in an under suit in a changing room. They then proceed to a wash room where their hands are scrubbed and disinfected and they gown up in an outer irradiated suit, hood, boots, mask and gloves.

On a weekly basis the operators must give a hand swab after washing and disinfecting their hands in the changing room and again in the sterile area. The swabs are tested for black spots (fungus).

The Arencos filling machines are monitored daily, swabs and settle plates are placed on the machine, if any contamination shows up on a regular basis, the machine must be thoroughly cleaned and disinfected by the operator. If it continues the area may be shut down until the source of the contamination is found. At this stage suspicion can be cast on the operators and management seeks reasons for the contamination from them.

On several occasions in the past the source of the contamination turned out to be that of the laboratory and not that of the sterile personnel.

On two occasions spillages of 480 litres of product spilled onto the floor. The machine operators cleaned up these spillages on both occasions.



## **Validations**

Validations are carried out on various batches of product mostly on injections e.g. Duopen Injection and intramamaries e.g. Spectrazol.

The reason for these validations is to ensure that the filling of the products is carried out correctly and meets the standards required. Should a new product be introduced to the area or new equipment i.e. flat bottom vessel with a stirrer attached to the bottom of the vessel validations are carried out to ensure that the product will not be effected by the change of equipment.

Validations are the responsibility of Technical Services but it is expected of the operators to perform the task of taking the necessary samples required for this test to be carried out correctly.

Samples must be taken on a daily basis throughout the entire batch at certain points during the fill.

It is not part of the machine operator's job description to perform this duty.

## Entering Sterile Manufacturing Area

Unauthorised personnel are not allowed to enter the Sterile Manufacturing Area. On entering the area all personnel must follow the S.O.P. at all times.

Anyone entering the area to work on a regular basis must be validated by the Micro Lab on three occasions. On the condition that they pass this validation they may enter on a regular basis.



**APPENDIX C**

**Company's Arguments  
Under Section 3(c) of the  
1974 Pay Act**

## **SKILL**

The job of the Filling Operative in the Sterile area involves a low level of skill. It only takes a short number of weeks to learn to perform the job. The Team Leader and the Maintenance Technician are present in the work area all of the time. Only some initiative is involved in the work.

There is a high level involved in the job performed by the Process Operator. It would take a minimum of 6 months to learn to perform the job competently. There is a high level of judgement involved in the work. For example, the individual must perform various tests on the tablets such as testing for thickness, hardness and weight, etc. Measure how quickly a tablet disintegrates in the animal stomach, check moisture content of tablets (and keep drying the product until one acquires the proper level of moisture). Also, this job involves doing tablet tool maintenance. This requires measuring the tips of dyes and polishing these in order to correct them. This job involves working in a room and the Team Leader would not be present in that room all of the time.

## **RESPONSIBILITY**

There is a low level of responsibility involved in the job of Filling Operative in the Sterile area.

There are hourly checks done on work by Quality Assurance Services and also by the Packaging Supervisor. Also, the Packers would check every pack. The Team Leader signs off any change of product before any work on a new product commences. The total maximum value of product handled by a single claimant would be £10,000 in a shift.

On the other hand there is high level of responsibility involved in the job of a Process Operator.

The Process Operator must carry out various tests to ensure that the product is of the required standard. A batch of product, which this individual would make up, could be destroyed. There could be over £50,000 worth of material in a batch.

These individuals also set up equipment which, if not done properly, can damage machinery (in addition to the obvious cost of lost production time when the machine is not operating).

### **MENTAL EFFORT**

There is a significant lower level of mental effort involved in the job of the Filling Operative in the Sterile area.

These individuals do a weight check every fifteen minutes and would record this. They would also load a machine every fifteen minutes. The record of the work done is checked by a Packaging Supervisor, the Production Manager and a qualified Chemist.

There is a significantly higher level of mental effort involved in the job performed by the Process Operator.

These individuals have to carry out various tests, e.g. thickness, hardness and weight of tablets. They also must make an adjustment to machinery if required to get the product right. They must concentrate on setting up equipment. They must concentrate on weighing the various ingredients which go into a mix. These individuals must sign off for everything as is done. They must fill in more complex forms, take samples and do accountability measures.

### **PHYSICAL EFFORT**

There is a low level of physical effort involved in the job performed by the Filling Operative in the Sterile area.

These individuals can sit down beside a machine most of the time. The filling of the machine with components involves lifting very low weights (4/5 kilogrammes) every 15 minutes.

There is significant physical effort involved in the job performed by the Process Operator.

There is a lot of pulling, dragging and lifting of heavy drums of material. The individual has to scoop product out of drums, which requires constant bending of one's back.

### **WORKING CONDITIONS**

The working conditions of Filling Operators in the Sterile area are reasonably good. The individuals are paid a special allowance for having to 'gown up' for working in the Sterile area. They must also wear ear protection all of the time due to the high levels of noise in the area.

The Process Operator job involves significantly more difficult working conditions. As with the claimants, they must wear ear protection due to the noise of the equipment. Also, they can be required to wear a respirator in dealing with particular products. Also they are required to set up equipment and dismantle equipment with the obvious hazards that are involved in handling industrial machinery.

**APPENDIX D**

**Equality Officer's  
Job Descriptions  
for the Claimants**

**Claimant's Name:** Ms. Pauline Doyle  
**Work Location:** Sterile Area  
**Job Title:** Machine Filling Operator  
**Reports to:** Packaging Supervisor  
**Organisation:** Schering Plough (Bray) Limited  
**Hours of Work:** 7.45a.m. - 4.30p.m. (Monday to Thursday)  
7.45a.m. - 3.30p.m. (Friday)

**Note:** The claimants are paid overtime for working from 7.45a.m.-8.00a.m. every morning.

**DUTIES:**

- Dress up in specially provided under and over suits. This procedure entails dressing in an undersuit comprising trousers and top; wearing specially provided shoes and if not wearing these shoes must cover shoes; wearing disposable gloves and covering hair with a disposable cap. Move from one dressing area to another and on arrival in the second dressing area changing shoe covers and disinfecting hands. Putting on the oversuit comprising hood, jumpsuit and special boots tightened around the foot and below the knee. Putting on a mask, protective glasses and ear muffs.
- To ensure a high level of hygiene the claimant gives weekly hand swabs (both inside and outside the sterile area) to microlab for testing purposes.
- Every six months have validation undertaken by microlab, this entails a dish being placed on your head, chest and leg three times on the one day.

**Arenco Filling Machine**

- The claimant turns on the machine and does a sample of five syringes to ensure that the machine is working correctly.
- The claimant carries out weight checks, checks for damaged plungers and over pressure. She records the results of her checks. If weights are not correct i.e. there is an acceptable tolerance of + or - 5 grams and if above or below this the claimant must adjust the machine by turning a knob located at the back of it.

- Once the machine is correctly set up the claimant fills three bowls which form part of the machine with three different components. The three different components (caps, plungers and barrels) are in bags and stacked up at the back of the machine. The claimant must know into which bowl to put each of the components.
- The claimant monitors the operation of the machine. She must ensure that the air release does not break, filling holes don't burst, machine does not get jammed, etc.
- The claimant must monitor the level of components in the bowls and keep replenishing them. It normally takes five minutes to empty the bowls.
- The fluid which goes into the syringes is in a vessel which is placed beside the machine and is pumped into the machine. There is generally 148,000 syringes in a batch and there is a counter on the machine so the claimant knows when the batch is nearly finished.
- During the course of the day the claimant takes 20 samples out of the process and treble bags them. These samples are tested in the microlab.
- At the end of the batch the claimant weighs five syringes as she did at the start of the batch.
- The claimant empties bags and bins at the end of the day. She cleans the outside of the machine.
- The claimant then completes the paperwork for the next day's work.

#### Vile/Injection Machine

- The claimant loads bottles onto the machine. As the machine is functioning the claimant loads trays of bottles every few minutes. These bottles are called viles. There are 48 x 100gram viles on a tray and 4,300 viles are filled daily (when the machine is in operation).
- There are two bowls on the machine. One holds seals and the other holds bungs i.e. rubber which goes into the viles. The claimant fills these bowls every 15 to 20 minutes.

- The claimant switches on the machine by pressing a button. The viles move onto a circular conveyor belt. They are filled with liquid which comes from a vessel located beside the machine. The seals come down a chute and the bottles are automatically sealed.
- The viles come out of the machine onto a conveyor belt and the claimant checks the seals on the viles to ensure that they are secure. The viles then go through a chute to the packing floor.
- The claimant undertakes weight checks every fifteen minutes.
- The claimant completes the paperwork. This happens at the start, throughout and at the end of the process. She also completes an accountability report setting out details of components obtained at the start of the process, the amount used and the quantity being returned.
- At the end of the day the claimant cleans down the machine, empties the bowls, sprays them with disinfectant, empties the rubbish bag and sweeps the floor.
- In the event of a line change the claimant must perform a line clearance before a new batch can be started.

#### Lexion Powder Machine

(Batches are undertaken on this machine on an irregular basis)

- The powder comes in bags and the claimant fills the bags of powder into the hopper.
- The claimant fills 30ml and 100ml bottles. There are 70 x 30ml bottles and 48 x 100ml bottles on a tray.
- The machine fills the bottles with powder and then puts a seal on them. The claimant checks the seals to ensure that they are secure.
- The claimant carries out weight checks at the beginning, throughout and at the end of the operation.

- The claimant puts samples (treble bagged) aside for testing in the laboratory.

#### Coprin New Zealand

(Used about 8 times per year. Operated by 3 people)

- At the start of the batch the claimant would complete the paperwork. She would then carry out checks on the first few samples to ensure that the machine is working correctly.
- The claimant uses 200ml bottles on this machine.
- There are three positions on this machine and the people operating this machine would change around every hour. One person fills the machine and the machine fills the product into the bottles. Another person puts bungs into the bottles while the third person puts the seals on the bottles.
- The claimant takes samples throughout the batch being made. These samples would be sent to the Labatory for testing.
- There is a strong smell of the product and the persons working on this machine can choose to wear a respirator.
- The claimant completes the paperwork and undertakes an accountability report. She performs checks on the last bottles produced from the batch.

#### Coprin UK

- This machine is used only if the Arenco Filling Machines are not functional. A batch can take 6 to 7 days to complete. Three people operate this machine.
- Before starting the claimant would get the paperwork. She would undertake a small number of samples on which she would perform checks and she would record the results on the paperwork.

- There is a wheel on the machine. One person fixes syringes into the wheel. The machine fills the product into the syringe. A second person puts the caps on the syringe and a third person checks their weight.
- The claimant records the weight details. Throughout the batch she takes samples which are tested by the laboratory.
- At the end of the batch the claimant complete her paperwork and undertakes an accountability report. She also performs line clearance to leave the machine clean for a new batch.

**Claimant's Name:** Ms. Elaine Crawford  
**Job Title:** Line Service Operator  
**Work Location:** Sterile Area  
**Reports to:** Packaging Supervisor  
**Organisation:** Schering Plough (Bray) Limited  
**Hours of Work:** 7.45a.m. - 4.30p.m. (Monday to Thursday)  
7.45a.m. - 3.30p.m. (Friday)

**DUTIES:**

- The claimant makes up the solutions used by staff to disinfect their hands. (This disinfectant goes on gloved hands). The claimant has instruction sheets for the solutions made up daily and she signs them.
- The claimant completes the task sheets for the solutions made up daily and she signs them.
- The claimant fills the solution into a large container and then pours it into smaller bottles. She labels the bottles and puts the date on the label.
- The claimant cleans the male and female dressing rooms with disinfectant i.e. she sprays them with disinfectant and she wipes down the cross-overs with a cloth. The claimant does this task four times a day i.e. at 8.30a.m.; 10.30a.m.; 1.30p.m. and 4.20p.m.
- The claimant brings the components from the airlock to the Sterile Area using the trolleys located beside the machines in the Sterile Area. She fills the trolley's silver containers with bags of components and she unbags them.
- The claimant gets from stores anything the operators in the Sterile Area will require e.g. gloves, masks, boots, suits, pens, etc. She puts them in their appropriate place.
- The claimant empties the laundry chutes. If she has a trolley she will do it once a day otherwise she must put the laundry into a bag and she would do it twice a day.
- If the claimant notices that the Sterile Area is short of anything which is for staff use she fills out an in-house requisition and passes it to the person who makes the orders.

- If short of components the claimant rings someone internally to order more.
- The claimant fills the soap dispensers.
- The claimant makes sure that the containers for blue overshoes and masks are full at all times.
- The claimant takes out samples of blue overshoes which she treble bags and sends for irradiation.
- The claimant fills the Arenco Filling Machine most days.

**APPENDIX E**

**Equality Officer's  
Job Descriptions for the  
Named Male Comparators**

The named male comparators are employed as Process Operators. They work on a number of processes namely:

Dispensing  
Powders  
Granulations  
Liquids  
Pastes  
Tablet Coating  
Tablet Printing  
PRB Assembly  
Compression

The comparators have had experience in working in the various process areas as follows:

**Name:** Mr. Martin Reilly  
**Process Areas:** All process areas

**Name:** Mr. Philip Byrne  
**Process Areas:** All process areas with the exception of Tablet Coating and Printing.

**Name:** Mr. Steven Hayden  
**Process Areas:** All process areas with the exception of Compression.

**Name:** Mr. Warren Neill  
**Process Areas:** Dispensing, Powders, Liquids, Pastes, PRB Assembly

**Job Title:** Process Operators  
**Report to:** Manufacturing Supervisor  
**Organisation:** Schering Plough (Bray) Limited  
**Hours of Work:** 8.00a.m. - 4.30p.m. (Monday - Thursday)  
8.00a.m. - 3.30p.m. (Friday)

Set out below are the duties associated with each of the Process Areas and undertaken by the named male comparators:

### **DISPENSING**

(2 Operators work on this process)

- ◆ Powders are dispensed for every batch. What this entails is the weighing out of materials for every batch. Every operation has line clearance and a logging procedure.
- ◆ The comparator gets the paperwork. The shop floor order gives the list of ingredients. It would not be the exact amount but it would be more than enough. All the raw material is got from the warehouse and it would be set aside on pallets and, once checked, it is brought to the dispensing area.
- ◆ The comparator performs a line clearance and log the product into a book. As every raw material must have a ticket the comparator would write them out at the start. For each batch the comparator works out the number of tickets required with the following details:

Batch Name  
Batch Number  
Batch Code  
Drum Number of Total Number (i.e. Drum 1 of 5)

- ◆ The comparator then works out the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require. He must use a separate scoop per raw material.
- ◆ The comparator lines the drum with a plastic bag. Then he dispenses the raw material into the drums. The raw material comes in containers of 2 to 90 kilos. As the comparator fills out the raw material into the drums he weighs it as he goes along. Every drum being dispensed must be labelled.
- ◆ The comparator fills out the shop order to go to the warehouse and he prints out a printout verifying that all weights have been dispensed.

### **Powders**

- ◆ The comparator meets with his supervisor and is told what powder to make. He collects the shop floor order and the batch history record. The product would have been dispensed and the comparator checks it off against his documentation.
  
- ◆ The comparator puts the product into the airlock and closes the door. He then changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, sleeves, overshoes and an airhood.
  
- ◆ The comparator carries the first part of the product into the room i.e. a 200 kilo batch. He also brings in a small quantity of the raw material i.e. 20 grams and 4 litres of liquid.
  
- ◆ The comparator brings in 194 kilos of starch in its original bags and he manually empties it into the mixing machine. Once emptied he disposes of the bags.
  
- ◆ The comparator then mixes the 20 grams of raw material (preservative) and the 4 litres of liquid. It takes a total of 40 minutes for the preservative to completely dissolve in the liquid i.e. 10 minutes to add the preservative to the liquid and 30 minutes to allow it to mix.
  
- ◆ The comparator adds this mix to the starch over a 2 minute period. He then washes down the insides of the bucket with 1 litre of water and adds this to the starch over the period of 1 minute. He mixes this for 30 minutes.
  
- ◆ While this is mixing the comparator weighs out 411.5 grams of the drug which is in a separate airhole. Only one person touches this drug.
  
- ◆ When the mix is ready the comparator adds the drug through a 20 mesh sieve. He allows it to mix for 10 minutes. The comparator opens the lid of the mixing bowl and scrapes the product off the lid. He then adds another powder product and leave to mix for 15 minutes.
  
- ◆ The comparator divides the product in the mixer evenly into three drums. These drums are on wheels.
  
- ◆ The comparator then performs/calculates accountability and completes the paperwork.

- ◆ For the packing process there are separate shop floor orders and batch history records. The comparator checks the scales to make sure that they are within tolerance. He also checks the boxes, bags, lids and dividers that are required.
  
- ◆ The comparator uses a stainless steel scoop. He makes sure that the scales are at zero and he puts 2.514 kilos in the bag. The comparator then displaces the air in the bag and seals it twice. He wipes it clean of any powder.
  
- ◆ The comparator puts a divider into the bottom of the box and then places the bag into the box. A box holds 8 bags and each bag is separated from each other by a divider. The last box in a batch may only have 6 or 7 bags in it along with two 100 gram samples in silverfoil pouches which are sealed and labelled.
  
- ◆ The comparator takes a 200 gram sample from each drum for internal laboratory testing.
  
- ◆ Throughout the filling process the comparator weighs bags, gets the average weight of four bags and completes this information on the paperwork/record logs.
  
- ◆ The comparator then packs the product onto pallets and puts them into an airlock. He puts a work-in-progress label on the box.
  
- ◆ The comparator gowns down and another person hoovers him off using pure water.
  
- ◆ The product is then taken to the warehouse where it is wrapped.

## **GRANULATIONS**

(2 Operators perform this process)

- ◆ All products have been dispensed. The raw material is in a drum on a pallet. The comparator gets the shop floor order, the batch history record and a printout of weight tickets of the raw material. He checks off the printout against other documentation to verify the information on all of the documentation.
- ◆ The comparator checks the extraction level in the room and records it on a sheet. He logs the product into the room before starting the process.
- ◆ The documentation tells the comparator what implements he will require and his first task is to gather them up.
- ◆ There are set procedures when doing granulations on powders, another set procedure for liquids, etc. There are a number of granulated products and the process for each is different. During the work inspection the comparator described the process for granulating one product.

### **GRANULATING PRB TABLETS**

- ◆ The comparator makes up a liquid which is sprayed on the powder when it is being mixed and he uses a mobile pump tank and mixer.
- ◆ The comparator mixes a blue dye with a raw material in a small V blender.
- ◆ The comparator prepares the raw material for mixing in a mixing machine.
- ◆ The comparator weighs the granulating solution. He adds it to the mobile tank mixer and mixes it with another raw material. The comparator allows it to mix for a set length of time as set out in the documentation and he monitors it as it is mixing to ensure that no lumps form.
- ◆ At this point of the process the comparator must put on protective clothing because the product is classified as dangerous. He puts on a disposable suit, sleeves, two pairs of disposable gloves, overshoes and an airhood which is battery powered and fully enclosed.
- ◆ The comparator then uses a forklift to take a pallet of product to the machine and he manually removes the product and loads it into the machine.

- ◆ Dry powder is mixed in the machine which has two blades i.e. a chopper blade and a main mixing blade. The granulated solution which has been mixed, as above, is pumped into the dry powder (raw material). The comparator pumps in a certain amount and then decides if he needs to add more.
- ◆ Once mixed the comparator opens the machine and empties out 150 kilos into one bowl, he then empties 120 kilos into another bowl and scrapes out the remaining 30 kilos into this second bowl.
- ◆ The comparator places a bowl at a time into the dryer and locks it into position. There are six different parameters to be set on the dryer. The comparator presses a switch to start the machine. It takes 30 minutes to dry the contents of one bowl. After 15 minutes the comparator removes the bowl and stirs the product so that the product at the bottom is brought to the top of the bowl. He then replaces it in the dryer.
- ◆ The comparator undertakes this same procedure for the second bowl of product.
- ◆ When completed the comparator takes a 10 gram sample which is brought to the laboratory to test its moisture content. The sample must reach a set value. If the moisture content is too high the comparator must put the bowl back into the dryer for a 5 minute period and then re-do the test.
- ◆ When the comparator is satisfied with the product in the bowls he manually loads them into 4 drums using a sieve and there are different sieves for different products. It takes 1 day to complete this process.
- ◆ The sieved product is then loaded into a large V blender where it is blended.
- ◆ The comparator adds a lubricant to the blender to make the powder flow better. Set out in the documentation is the length of time the product should be left in the blender. Once the product is blended it is dropped into three drums and the comparator brushes out any remaining product that is left.
- ◆ The comparator removes three samples from each of the three drums i.e a total of nine samples. He labels them and brings them to the laboratory for testing.

- ◆ The comparator labels and seals the drums and brings them to the warehouse.
- ◆ The paperwork is up-dated throughout and again at the end of the process. The comparator then performs line clearance and accountability i.e what you had at the start, what is left at the end and ensures that it is within 98% - 102% range.
- ◆ It is crucial that the comparator signs off on the tank.

**Note:** Mobile steam tanks are used on some granulations and they have to be heated.

## **LIQUIDS**

(Process can take 1 or 2 days and it is performed by 2 operators)

- ◆ The comparator checks all the materials which are required in this process. He checks the weight tickets against the Batch History Records.

- ◆ The comparator checks the equipment which he will use for this process to ensure that it is clean.
  
- ◆ There are two tanks in the room and the comparator fills both with R.O water i.e a very pure water. This water is pumped into the room and there is a hose from the pipe to the machine. Sometimes the comparator may only need to use one tank depending on the batch.
  
- ◆ Instructions are set out in the Batch History Sheets and the comparator checks them to see if the water has to be heated.
  
- ◆ The comparator turns on the mixers. Throughout the process he records all the details on the Batch History Records.
  
- ◆ The comparator heats the water to the required temperature and then adds in the new materials. The Batch History Records tell the comparator what weight of raw material is required and when it is to be added.
  
- ◆ The comparator then goes downstairs to the pipes which are underneath the tanks. He must adjust the transfer and re-circulation valves which dictate the way the product flows.
  
- ◆ The comparator leave the mix overnight.
  
- ◆ The comparator adds the raw material (the active i.e the main component of the drug) to a smaller tank. He connects up various hoses from the smaller to the bigger tank and changes around the transfer and re-circulation valves. Once the contents of the smaller tank have transferred to the bigger tank the comparator goes back downstairs and changes the valves around again.
  
- ◆ The comparator lets the liquid re-circulate for the required amount of time. He then heats it and leaves it to cool. There is a control panel on the wall which the comparator uses to dictate transfer, circulation, heating, cooling and cleaning.
  
- ◆ When at the required cooling temperature the comparator takes samples for testing in the laboratory.

- ◆ The comparator then changes the hoses to transfer the liquid into a holding vessel which is located in the next room.
- ◆ The comparator puts a work-in-progress label on the holding vessel. He puts a “to be cleaned” sign on the door of the room in which the process took place.
- ◆ The comparator undertakes accountability, completes his paperwork and signs off on the job.

**PASTES :**

- ◆ The comparator starts the process by organising the Shop Order, the Batch History Records and the materials needed for the task. He checks weights and logs codes on tickets and printouts.
- ◆ The comparator checks equipment to ensure that it is clean. He gets any additional equipment he may need for the job e.g scoops.

- ◆ There are certain oils in most pastes. The comparator puts the oil in a big mixing bowl. The Batch History Record sets out the quantity of oil that must be added to a batch. The oil is added using a pump or by a Process Operator who can drive a forklift truck.
- ◆ The comparator adds the raw material e.g preservatives. The Batch History Record tells how much raw material is to be added and the comparator records the times of adding the raw material.
- ◆ There is a temperature chart on the control panel and the comparator must monitor it because the temperature should not exceed 50°C. The comparator must check the temperature using a hand held thermometer.
- ◆ The comparator mixes the paste for a defined length of time e.g 1½hours. While the mix is in progress the comparator must monitor the temperature because if it is not kept at a specified level the batch could be destroyed.
- ◆ The comparator updates his documentation.
- ◆ At this stage of the process the comparator must put on protective clothing i.e dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs.
- ◆ When the mix is complete the comparator lifts the lid and takes samples which he then takes to the laboratory. The laboratory performs ph tests on the samples. If the ph test is OK then the mix is ready, otherwise the comparator must mix the product again and re-do the tests. The comparator continues to undertake this process until satisfied that the mix is ready.
- ◆ The comparator removes the lid which is attached to the machine. He scrapes down the mixture/paste off the blades to avoid wastage. The bowl underneath the machine comes out from the machine on wheels. The comparator removes the bowl of mixture/paste and covers the top of it with plastic. He then moves it to the packaging area where he locks it into a square metal box and closes down the lid.

- ♦ The comparator completes and checks his paperwork and he carries out an accountability report. The comparator gives the room a general clean and puts a notice on the door stating "To be Cleaned".
- ♦ The comparator passes his paperwork to the supervisor.

**TABLET COATING:**

(3 Operators one for each pan)

- ♦ There are three different types of tablets that are coated. All three processes are different but basically the same.
- ♦ The comparator gets the finished tablets which have been compressed. He gets the Shop Order and the Batch History Record. There are 10 different types of raw materials that are used in the coating process and the ones to be used in this batch are dispatched and the

comparator checks the raw materials off against the Shop Order and the Batch History Record.

- ◆ The comparator follows the procedures as set out in the Batch History Record.
- ◆ The comparator makes up the solutions. He must give each three coats. The 1st coat is a sealing coat which prevents the tablet from taking in moisture, otherwise it would fall apart. The second coat is to put bulk on the tablet. The third coat is to whiten and smooth the tablet coat.
- ◆ The comparator splits the tablet into three equal parts and loads approximately 140-150 kilos into the sugar coating pans. These are round vessels that spin. There is an inlet and an outlet air supply to each pan and the parameters for the air supply is set out for the comparator in the Batch History Record.
- ◆ The comparator turns on the pan to allow the mixing of the tablets to start. He adds in the solution to the tablets in the pans and he records the time at which the solution was added in. He also records the length of time that the tablet were left to dry before the next solution was added.
- ◆ Some batches of tablets have to get a final waxing coat. The comparator puts 20 - 30 kilos of wax into another pan and mixes the tablets in the wax.
- ◆ If the comparator has to put a polishing coat on the tablets (this is only done on particular types of tablets). When doing this job the comparator must wear protective clothing namely a respirator, an airhood and two sets of overalls.
- ◆ The entire process takes three days to complete and at the end of every day the comparator must remove the tablets from the pans, sieve them and place them on racks to dry. The pans are re-loaded with the tablets the next day.
- ◆ After the process is complete the comparator loads the tablets into drums. He weighs the drums and calculates the average weight of each tablet. He takes samples which are sent to the laboratory. The drums of tablets are sent to the warehouse.
- ◆ The comparator undertakes line clearance and an accountability report.

**TABLET PRINTING:**

- ◆ The comparator organises the paperwork i.e gets the Shop Order and the Batch History Sheet. He is assigned a batch of tablets which have been coated. The comparator checks them off against the Shop Order and the Batch History Sheet.
  
- ◆ On the Shop Order there are details of the ink supplied for the printing process and the comparator checks the expiry date.
  
- ◆ The comparator mixes the ink with a solution to make up a printed solution. He then loads the tablets into a printing machine (1 kilo at a time). He constantly tops up the tablets to keep them at the same level i.e. 1 kilo.

- ◆ The comparator sets up round plates which contain the print which goes on the tablets. He adds the ink solution. The plate prints on the tablets as the machine is running.
- ◆ The comparator may have to adjust the speed on the machine when the tablets are being printed.
- ◆ The comparator takes samples of the printed tablets. He must look at the tablets for the different characteristics they must meet in order to be passed. The comparator monitors the print characteristics of the tablets until such time as the batch is complete. On average it takes the comparator two days to complete a batch.
- ◆ At the end of the batch the comparator strips down the machine and cleans it. He also undertakes line clearance and performs an accountability report.

#### **PRB ASSEMBLY :**

The purpose of this process is to make a boli of sizes 5, 6 and 7. There are two machines which undertake this process. One is used for a 5 and 6 bolus while the other is used for a 7 bolus. Both machines are exactly the same. There are two types of boli namely a ready pulse and a first grazer. In the ready pulse type the cap is open and the tablet is exposed whereas in the first grazer the cap is closed. The first grazer bolus works over time thereby avoiding the need to administer a regular dosage of drugs to the animal.

- ◆ The comparator gets his paperwork. He checks off quantities on the Shop Order. He also checks the quantities of core ends, washers, segments and end caps to ensure that he has sufficient quantities of each.

- ◆ The comparator brings the product into the room where the machine is located. He places all the components in strategic positions around the machine and close to the hoppers.
- ◆ The comparator checks the labels on the product to ensure that they are correct and he gets the supervisor to sign off on the weight tickets.
- ◆ When the machine is turned on by the comparator the core ends come down a conveyor. Two sensors push them into position for pickup and another two sensors put them into a nest. Added to a core end is a tablet in a segment and between each tablet segment is a washer. The core ends go around the machine until the full number (5 or 6 or 7) of tablets are on them. An empty cap is finally added to the top of each of the core ends.
- ◆ Throughout the process the comparator is continuously filling bowls approximately every 3 minutes. The production of 4,000 boli per day would result in the use of 20,000 caps. He is also checking the components to ensure that the segments have a centre hole and that no tablets are broken. If he does not check these things it is likely that problems like these could cause the machine to jam. If the machine jams the comparator must repair it. On most occasions he is able to free the jam.
- ◆ The comparator also keeps a check on the sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. Dust on the sensors can cause problems in the operation of the machine.
- ◆ The boli goes on a conveyor belt to a packer who packs between 185 and 190 boli into a 4 stone tub. The packer must ensure that each bolus contains no dents. The comparator checks the packer's work every hour to ensure that, where necessary, the boli have been rejected.
- ◆ The comparator completes the paperwork as the process is progressing.
- ◆ While working in the room with this machine the comparator must wear earplugs, safety glasses, gloves and overalls.

- ◆ When doing 5 tablet boli the comparator does 570 boli per hour with a target of 22 tubs in an 8 hour day i.e. 4,000 boli per shift; 6 tablet boli the comparator has a target of 3,500 - 3,600 boli per shift and 7 tablet boli with a target of 2,300 per shift.
  
- ◆ The comparator puts 27 tubs on a pallet and he places a work-in-progress label on it. This details the quantity and code. The pallet is then left outside the room.
  
- ◆ The comparator undertakes line clearance i.e clears the lines of everything in the machines. He then does the accountability i.e the amount of product used to the amount of product received.
  
- ◆ While the machine is working the comparator is undertaking re-work. If more than three tablets in a bolus are broken the comparator does not re-work the bolus. To re-work a bolus the comparator places a bolus in a machine and he brings down the lever on the bolus. He removes up to the point of the problem. When the main batch of boli are made the comparator manually inserts the half made up bolus into the nests in the machine. There are 32 nests in the machine. At any one time only all boli requiring an additional two tablets are put into the machine at the same time. If a bolus required three tablets to be added to it then only boli requiring three tablets would be put into the machine. The comparator turns on the machine and the boli are completed in the same manner as boli being made up from the beginning.
  
- ◆ If a fault is detected on a re-worked bolus the comparator does not re-work it again.
  
- ◆ The comparator puts the ready pulse boli i.e open end boli firstly through a separate sub-assembly machine. This machine has bowls for segments, tablets and rings. Having completed the sub-assembly these boli are ready to be put on the main PRB machine. The packer does the re-work on the ready pulse boli.
  
- ◆ After the batch is finished the comparator sweeps the area. He hoovers the machine and cleans the bowls.
  
- ◆ Boli are made up in either white or blue tablets. When changing from one to the other the comparator must clean down the machine fully.

## **COMPRESSION**

- ◆ Before starting the compression process the comparator must make sure that the room and machine are clean. Furthermore all new parts brought into the room must also be clean. The comparator must then set up the tablet machine which can take one or two days. As the tools for the machine are stored in oil the comparator must clean the oil off them.
- ◆ The comparator then puts the dyes (i.e the pieces of equipment) into the machine. All bar one machine have 16 dyes while the exception has 27. Each dye is put into the machine one at a time for shaped tooling and they are put in all together for round tooling.
- ◆ The comparator lubricates the upper and lower punches with grease and puts them into the machine. Also he inserts pins to keep the dyes in place.

- ◆ The comparator puts the upper and lower cams into position and bolts them in.
  
- ◆ At this stage the comparator can put the remaining parts on the machine i.e covers, safety guards, etc. The comparator sets the hopper height for the flow of powder onto the machine. The height of the hopper comes from experience. He also sets the feed frame and he sets it as close to the dye table without touching it. This is important to assist in the flow of materials into dyes to make the tablets. The comparator then places in the flat and secures it with tie wraps. The comparator sets up the tablet deduster and he brings the rotary into the room and plugs it in.
  
- ◆ The comparator then gets his paperwork from the supervisor/team leader. He is assigned a batch of granulated powder which he must verify has passed quarantine and he must check the manufacture date. The supervisor/team leader signs off and the comparator countersigns. The paperwork specifies the location of the batch and the quantity of it. The comparator locates the batch in the warehouse and takes it to the compression area either on a trolley or more likely on a forklift.

To compress the batch and make it into tablets:

- ◆ The comparator fills the hopper with granulated powder. The batch comes in different sizes from 150 - 1,200 kilos. It is in drums on a pallet ranging in size from 140 - 200 kilos in a single drum. The comparator manually takes the drums off the pallet into the compression room and he fills the contents of the drum into the hopper using a scoop. While there are 7 or 8 compressing machines, only one automatically vacuums the powder into the hoppers.
  
- ◆ The comparator connects up a plastic tube to the machine and also to the deduster. The deduster takes off any loose material from the tablets and minimises the dust in the room. The comparator also sets up the extraction in the roof.
  
- ◆ The comparator manually winds the machine on by hand and adjusts, as necessary. He does this to afford him the opportunity of restricting the powder going into the machine. There are set parameters the comparator must meet as a result of the adjustments and these are set down in the paperwork. The comparator puts the parameters into a small computer to ensure a uniformity of weight and to establish the permitted limits.

♦ The comparator does 20 tablets initially. He undertakes a number of tests with these tablets:

- The comparator sets up the parameters in the computer. He adds a tablet one at a time to get a read-out of the mean value.
- The comparator also takes a thickness measure of the tablet using a computerised thickness reader. He must do this for a full round of dyes to make sure none are out of specification. The comparator has a range target to meet and he may have to adjust the machine to meet that range.
- The comparator must test tablets for weight loss and robustness.
- The comparator carries out a disintegration test which shows how long the tablet takes to dissolve in water.
  
- The comparator also undertakes a tablet hardness test. The documentation identifies which of the two hardness tests (neutous or kilo) is to be done. For the hardness test the comparator breaks 5 tablets. There are two different sets of jaws to be used, one is flat and the other meets at the breaking line of the tablet and breaks it there.

♦ Failure in any test can result in the comparator having to make more adjustments to the machine and then re-doing all the test again. When all the tests are completed the comparator must find a happy medium between the tests. It generally takes one or two adjustments before it is right. The comparator logs all the test results in the paperwork and signs off on it and the supervisor/team leader also must sign off on it to allow the comparator to proceed.

♦ The comparator weighs the drums that tablets are filled into and he makes up 4 or 5 labels with the following details:

Weight  
Product Name  
Date  
Drum Number  
Quantity

There will be between 10 and 25 kilos per single drum. A label goes on the drum with the following details:

Batch Name  
Batch Number  
Date of doing job  
Weight of drum  
Gross weight  
Tear (weight of drum and bag)  
Net weight

- ◆ The comparator is now ready to start tablet production. He brings in an empty drum and puts it in under the deduster. Then he switches on the machine and the deduster. From the first drum the comparator takes a first batch sample for testing in the laboratory. The paperwork sets out the number of tablets to take as a sample. The comparator prepares a label for the sample setting out the name of the batch, the batch number, the date of manufacture, area (i.e compression) and the number of tablets. He then signs and dates the label.
- ◆ The comparator fills the hopper either every 10 minutes or every 30 minutes. As the process proceeds the comparator carries out the initial tests again to ensure that they meet specification. The weight test is performed every 30 minutes and the rest every 2 hours. The machine may have to be adjusted on the basis of the test results. Samples are taken at the start, middle and end of the batch.
- ◆ At the end of the batch the comparator must manually weigh every test for the last 500 grams which is in the feed frame. It goes to the point where the product does not meet the target and is rejected but not discarded.
- ◆ The comparator turns off the machine. He then deletes the parameters on the computer. He inputs the average weight of the tested tablets throughout the batch, totals and divides this figure into the total amount filled into the drum to get the total amount produced.
- ◆ The comparator then completes the work-in-progress label which is put on the pallet. The label contains the following details:

Tablet Name  
Batch Number  
Batch Code  
Quantities in Kg  
Quantities in tablets

- ◆ The comparator then produces an accountability report. This is a statement of all the product remaining after he deducts what he used from what he originally got from stores. The comparator completes the paperwork and signs off on it before passing it to his supervisor.
  
- ◆ The comparator puts the drums on pallets and shrink wraps them before moving them to the warehouse using a pallet truck.
  
- ◆ The comparator strips down the machine. He removes the safety guards and the lower punch guards. He takes the deduster and the extraction hose out of the room and puts them on a pallet to be washed.
  
- ◆ The comparator removes the tooling from the machine i.e pins, dyes, upper and lower punches and cams. These parts are fragile, for example if they get knocked together they get damaged, so he cleans them himself. The comparator takes these tools to the equipment room where he thoroughly cleans them in a bucket of Industrial Metholated Spirits. He makes sure the facing of the tools which emboss the tablets is very clean. As he cleans the tools he checks for damage.
  
- ◆ If the comparator discovers a damaged tool he repairs it. There are a number of implements available to him with which to repair the tool.
  
- ◆ If no damage is discovered or if the damage has been repaired the comparator completes a card to say that there is no damage on the upper and lower head and crown, tip face (emboss) or the outer circumference.
  
- ◆ The comparator then stores the tools in oil on a tray to prevent rust.



**APPENDIX F**

**Equality Officer's**

**Analysis**

## **Ms. Pauline Doyle (*Claimant*) vs Mr. Martin Reilly (*Comparator*)**

### **Skill:**

The claimant operates a variety of machines. She must have the ability to perform weight checks on syringes, viles, etc depending on the machine she is operating. The claimant must know how to adjust the machine in the event that the weight checks are not acceptable and she must be constantly aware of what is or what is not acceptable weights for the various products i.e viles, syringes, etc. On the Arenco Filling machine and the vile/injection machine the claimant must know what components go into what bowls. In the event of a batch change the claimant must clean down the machines thoroughly.

The comparator operates a variety of machines for the purpose of undertaking different processes. In carrying out the liquids process the comparator must be able to properly adjust valves to dictate the way the product flows. He must connect up hoses from one tank to another when adding drugs to the mixture. The comparator must know how to use the control panel to undertake specific functions e.g circulation, heating, cooling, etc. In carrying out the pastes process the comparator must be able to add oil and other raw materials e.g preservative to the mixture. He must also know how to remove the bowl from the machine. In undertaking the powders process the comparator must know the correct quantities of the materials which should be added to the process. When packing the powder the comparator must ensure that the scales are correctly set within tolerance levels. The comparator must know how to make either of two types of boli when operating the PRB Assembly. He must know what components go into each specific bowl. The comparator must have the ability to free up any jams which result in the operation of the machine. He must also be able to operate a machine for re-work i.e boli which are rejected because, for example a tablet may be broken. The comparator must know how to manually input rejected boli into the machine so that they can be completed correctly. When the comparator is doing ready pulse boli he must know how to operate the initial separate sub-assembly machine. In carrying out the dispensing process the comparator must calculate the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require based on the quantities and batch of raw material being dispensed. To undertake the granulation process the comparator must be able to use various pieces of equipment e.g mobile pump tank, mixer, dryer, etc. He must also have the ability to use a forklift truck to take pallets of product from the stores area to the machine. The comparator must know what coats to give to the various tablets when doing tablet coating. When undertaking tablet printing the comparator must be able to set up the round plates in the

machine. He must also have the ability to adjust the speed of the machine. At the end of the printing process the comparator must know how to strip down the machine. When undertaking compression the comparator must know how to put the various dyes (i.e pieces of equipment) into the machine. He must know the height at which to set the hopper. This skill is acquired through experience. The comparator has to connect a plastic tube and a deduster to the machine. He sets up the extraction in the roof. In the compression process the comparator must perform a number of tests on the tablets and then adjust the machine, if necessary. At the end of the compression process the comparator must weigh every tablet for the last 500 grams in the feed frame. He uses a pallet truck to move the pallets containing drums of product to the warehouse. The comparator must be able to remove all the pins, dyes, punches and cams from the machines. He must clean them and ensure that they do not hit up against each other otherwise they can be damaged. The comparator must be able to repair damaged tools, where possible.

***I find that the skills required of the comparator are greater than those required of the claimant.***

### **Physical Effort.**

The claimant stands for much of her job. She lifts trays of viles and load them onto the vile/injection machine and she also lifts trays of bottles for the Lexion Powder machine. The claimant removes rubbish from the work area on a daily basis. She also undertakes a line clearance when changing from one batch to another.

In this job the comparator is constantly on his feet. When undertaking the pastes process the comparator must exert effort in scraping the mixture off the blades. He also must lift heavy bags of raw materials. When carrying out the powders process the comparator washes down the inside of the bucket with water. He also exerts physical effort in loading packs of powder product onto pallets. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator exerts physical effort in removing machine jams. He hoovers the machine and cleans the bowls after a batch is complete. When changing from different coloured tablets the comparator must clean down the machine thoroughly. During the granulations process the comparator must use physical effort to move product from the pallet and load it into the machine. He must empty bowls containing 150 kilo batch of product and he must scrape it out fully. The comparator must manually load the product from the bowls into drums using a sieve. While doing tablet coating the comparator is constantly moving between the various

pans of tablets. After the tablet printing process is complete the comparator must strip down the machine. During the compression process the comparator exerts physical effort in setting up and dismantling the machine. He lifts drums of tablets onto pallets and uses a pallet truck to move them to the warehouse.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of physical effort.***

### **Mental Effort.**

The claimant monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly and that components e.g vials, syringes, caps, etc are being replenished constantly. The claimant checks weights and records the details of these checks. She also completes an accountability report setting out the details of the components received at the start of the process, the amount used and the quantity being returned.

The comparator monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly. When working on the liquids process the comparator must ensure that the mixture is heated to the correct temperature. When carrying out the pastes process the comparator must monitor the temperature to ensure that it does not exceed 50°C. He must also review the ph test results so as to determine when the mix is ready. When undertaking the powders process the comparator must ensure that the preservative is completely dissolved in liquid. He must attempt to spread the mix evenly over the drums. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must ensure that the bowls of components are constantly replenished. He must check the boli to ensure that they are made up to specification e.g no broken tablets. The comparator constantly checks the sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. He completes accountability reports for all the various processes he undertakes. When working on the granulations process the comparator checks the extraction level in the room. He monitors the mix to ensure that it contains no lumps and that it is mixed for a defined length of time. The comparator undertakes a test on the moisture content of the product. He updates the paperwork, performs line clearance and produces an accountability report. When doing tablet coating the comparator must know at what stage in the coating process are the various pans of tablets. He has to calculate the average weight of the drums of tablets at the end of the process. During the tablet printing process the comparator must monitor the speed at which

the tablets are being printed and adjust, if necessary. He also has to monitor the print characteristics of the tablets. When undertaking the compression process the comparator must ensure that he puts in the various pieces of equipment into the machine correctly. He must ensure that the paperwork (e.g test result logs) is up-to-date and accurate. The comparator must ensure that the facing of the tools which emboss the tablets are very clean. At the end of the compression process the comparator must calculate the total amount of tablets produced.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator, in terms of mental effort, are higher than those made on the claimant.***

### **Responsibility:**

The claimant is responsible for ensuring that the bowls on the Arenco Filling machine and the Viles machine are correctly filled and she is responsible for replenishing them regularly. She is also responsible for the samples she takes from the machines. The claimant is responsible for all the paperwork she completes throughout the process and she is also responsible for the accountability reports which she completes.

The comparator has responsibility for the processes he undertakes and he must ensure that there is no product waste due to errors in the length of time a product should be mixed, etc. When placing stickers on products the comparator must ensure that the details on the stickers are correct. He is responsible for ensuring that the correct raw materials are added in the various processes. The comparator must ensure that he correctly logs process details and that his accountability reports at the end of the processes are accurate. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the proper quantities of product are added to the granulating process. He must ensure that the product is not too moist and that the powder flows freely i.e sufficient lubricant is added. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the tablets are properly coated. He must maintain a record of when the solution is added to the tablets and the length of time tablets were left to dry before the next solution was added. The comparator is also responsible for printing the tablets. He must ensure that they are printed properly. At the end of the process the comparator is responsible for stripping down the machine and cleaning it properly. When undertaking the compression process the comparator is responsible for setting up the machine properly. He must verify that the granulated powder has passed quarantine. During compression the comparator is responsible for ensuring that all tests are performed, results recorded and machines

adjusted as necessary. He must ensure that drums are properly labelled and that the accountability report is complete and accurate. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the various tools (e.g bits, cams, punches, etc) are clean and not damaged. He is responsible for repairing any damaged tools.

***I am satisfied that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of responsibility.***

**Working Conditions:**

The claimant works in a sterile environment. She wears a special suit, shoes, gloves, ear muffs and surgical mask. The noise level in the sterile area is high.

The comparator works in different environments. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must wear earplugs as the noise levels are extremely high. During the pastes process the comparator must wear protective clothing e.g dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs. While working on the powders process the comparator changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and an airhood. At the end of the powders process the comparator is hosed down with pure water. During the granulation process the comparator must wear protective clothing because the product is classified as dangerous.

***Having balanced the demands made on both the claimant and the comparator, in terms of working conditions, I am satisfied that the demands made on the claimant are greater than those made on the comparator.***

## **Ms. Pauline Doyle (*Claimant*) vs Mr. Philip Byrne (*Comparator*)**

### **Skill:**

The claimant operates a variety of machines. She must have the ability to perform weight checks on syringes, viles, etc depending on the machine she is operating. The claimant must know how to adjust the machine in the event that the weight checks are not acceptable and she must be constantly aware of what is or what is not acceptable weights for the various products i.e viles, syringes, etc. On the Arenco Filling machine and the vile/injection machine the claimant must know what components go into what bowls. In the event of a batch change the claimant must clean down the machines thoroughly.

The comparator operates a variety of machines for the purpose of undertaking different processes. In carrying out the liquids process the comparator must be able to properly adjust valves to dictate the way the product flows. He must connect up hoses from one tank to another when adding drugs to the mixture. The comparator must know how to use the control panel to undertake specific functions e.g circulation, heating, cooling, etc. In carrying out the pastes process the comparator must be able to add oil and other raw materials e.g preservative to the mixture. He must also know how to remove the bowl from the machine. In undertaking the powders process the comparator must know the correct quantities of the materials which should be added to the process. When packing the powder the comparator must ensure that the scales are correctly set within tolerance levels. The comparator must know how to make either of two types of boli when operating the PRB Assembly. He must know what components go into each specific bowl. The comparator must have the ability to free up any jams which result in the operation of the machine. He must also be able to operate a machine for re-work i.e boli which are rejected because, for example a tablet may be broken. The comparator must know how to manually input rejected boli into the machine so that they can be completed correctly. When the comparator is doing ready pulse boli he must know how to operate the initial separate sub-assembly machine. In carrying out the dispensing process the comparator must calculate the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require based on the quantities and batch of raw material being dispensed. To undertake the granulation process the comparator must be able to use various pieces of equipment e.g mobile pump tank, mixer, dryer, etc. He must also have the ability to use a forklift truck to take pallets of product from the stores area to the machine. When undertaking compression the comparator must know how to put the various dyes (i.e pieces of equipment) into the machine. He must know the height at which to set the hopper. This skill

is acquired through experience. The comparator has to connect a plastic tube and a deduster to the machine. He sets up the extraction in the roof. In the compression process the comparator must perform a number of tests on the tablets and then adjust the machine, if necessary. At the end of the compression process the comparator must weigh every tablet for the last 500 grams in the feed frame. He uses a pallet truck to move the pallets containing drums of product to the warehouse. The comparator must be able to remove all the pins, dyes, punches and cams from the machines. He must clean them and ensure that they do not hit up against each other otherwise they can be damaged. The comparator must be able to repair damaged tools, where possible.

***I find that the skills required of the comparator are greater than those required of the claimant.***

### **Physical Effort**

The claimant stands for much of her job. She lifts trays of vials and load them onto the vial/injection machine and she also lifts trays of bottles for the Lexion Powder machine. The claimant removes rubbish from the work area on a daily basis. She also undertakes a line clearance when changing from one batch to another.

In this job the comparator is constantly on his feet. When undertaking the pastes process the comparator must exert effort in scraping the mixture off the blades. He also must lift heavy bags of raw materials. When carrying out the powders process the comparator washes down the inside of the bucket with water. He also exerts physical effort in loading packs of powder product onto pallets. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator exerts physical effort in removing machine jams. He hoovers the machine and cleans the bowls after a batch is complete. When changing from different coloured tablets the comparator must clean down the machine thoroughly. During the granulations process the comparator must use physical effort to move product from the pallet and load it into the machine. He must empty bowls containing 150 Kilo batch of product and he must scrape it out fully. The comparator must manually load the product from the bowls into drums using a sieve. During the compression process the comparator exerts physical effort in setting up and dismantling the machine. He lifts drums of tablets onto pallets and uses a pallet truck to move them to the warehouse.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of physical effort.***

**Mental Effort.**

The claimant monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly and that components e.g vials, syringes, caps, etc are being replenished constantly. The claimant checks weights and records the details of these checks. She also completes an accountability report setting out the details of the components received at the start of the process, the amount used and the quantity being returned.

The comparator monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly. When working on the liquids process the comparator must ensure that the mixture is heated to the correct temperature. When carrying out the pastes process the comparator must monitor the temperature to ensure that it does not exceed 50°C. He must also review the pH test results so as to determine when the mix is ready. When undertaking the powders process the comparator must ensure that the preservative is completely dissolved in liquid. He must attempt to spread the mix evenly over the drums. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must ensure that the bowls of components are constantly replenished. He must check the boli to ensure that they are made up to specification e.g no broken tablets. The comparator constantly checks the sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. The comparator completes accountability reports for all the various processes he undertakes. When working on the granulations process the comparator checks the extraction level in the room. He monitors the mix to ensure that it contains no lumps and that it is mixed for a defined length of time. The comparator undertakes a test on the moisture content of the product. He updates the paperwork, performs line clearance and produces an accountability report. When undertaking the compression process the comparator must ensure that he puts in the various pieces of equipment into the machine correctly. He must ensure that the paperwork (e.g test result logs) is up-to-date and accurate. The comparator must ensure that the facing of the tools which emboss the tablets are very clean. At the end of the compression process the comparator must calculate the total amount of tablets produced.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator, in terms of mental effort, are higher than those made on the claimant.***

### **Responsibility:**

The claimant is responsible for ensuring that the bowls on the Arenco Filling machine and on the Viles machine are correctly filled and she is responsible for replenishing them regularly. She is also responsible for the samples she takes from the machines. The claimant has responsibility for all the paperwork she completes throughout the process and she is also responsible for the accountability reports which she completes.

The comparator has responsibility for the process he undertakes and he must ensure that there is no product waste due to errors in the length of time a product should be mixed, etc. When placing stickers on products the comparator must ensure that the details on the stickers are correct. He is responsible for ensuring that the correct raw materials are added in the various processes. The comparator must ensure that he correctly logs process details and that his accountability reports at the end of the processes are accurate. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the proper quantities of product are added to the granulating process. He must ensure that the product is not too moist and that the powder flows freely i.e sufficient lubricant is added. He must also label the product correctly and ensure that all tests results are accurately recorded. When undertaking the compression process the comparator is responsible for setting up the machine properly. He must verify that the granulated powder has passed quarantine. During compression the comparator is responsible for ensuring that all tests are performed, results recorded and machines adjusted as necessary. He must ensure that drums are properly labelled. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the various tools (e.g bits, cams, punches, etc) are clean and not damaged. He is responsible for repairing any damaged tools.

***I am satisfied that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of responsibility.***

### **Working Conditions:**

The claimant works in a sterile environment. She wears a special suit, shoes, gloves, ear muffs and surgical mask. The noise level in the sterile area is high.

The comparator works in different environments. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must wear earplugs as the noise levels are extremely high. During the pastes process the comparator must wear protective clothing e.g dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs. While working on the powders process the comparator changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and an airhood. At the end of the powders process the comparator is hosed down with pure water. During the granulation process the comparator must wear protective clothing because the product is classified as dangerous. The atmosphere in which the comparator works when doing tablet coating is very dusty. He must wear protective clothing when putting a polishing coat on the tablets.

***Having balanced the demands made on both the claimant and the comparator, in terms of working conditions, I am satisfied that the demands made on the claimant are greater than those made on the comparator.***

**Ms. Pauline Doyle (*Claimant*) vs Mr. Steven Hayden  
(*Comparator*)**

**Skill:**

The claimant operates a variety of machines. She must have the ability to perform weight checks on syringes, viles, etc depending on the machine she is operating. The claimant must know how to adjust the machine in the event that the weight checks are not acceptable and she must be constantly aware of what is or what is not acceptable weights for the various products i.e viles, syringes, etc. On the Arenco Filling machine and the vile/injection machine the claimant must know what components go into what bowls. In the event of a batch change the claimant must clean down the machines thoroughly.

The comparator operates a variety of machines for the purpose of undertaking different processes. In carrying out the liquids process the comparator must be able to properly adjust valves to dictate the way the product flows. He must connect up hoses from one tank to another when adding drugs to the mixture. The comparator must know how to use the control panel to undertake specific functions e.g circulation, heating, cooling, etc. In carrying out the pastes process the comparator must be able to add oil and other raw materials e.g preservative to the mixture. He must also know how to remove the bowl from the machine. In undertaking the powders process the comparator must know the correct quantities of the materials which should be added to the process. When packing the powder the comparator must ensure that the scales are correctly set within tolerance levels. The comparator must know how to make either of two types of boli when operating the PRB Assembly. He must know what components go into each specific bowl. The comparator must have the ability to free up any jams which result in the operation of the machine. He must also be able to operate a machine for re-work i.e boli which are rejected because, for example a tablet may be broken. The comparator must know how to manually input rejected boli into the machine so that they can be completed correctly. When the comparator is doing ready pulse boli he must know how to operate the initial separate sub-assembly machine. In carrying out the dispensing process the comparator must calculate the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require based on the quantities and batch of raw material being dispensed. To undertake the granulation process the comparator must be able to use various pieces of equipment e.g mobile pump tank, mixer, dryer, etc. He must also have the ability to use a forklift truck to take pallets of product from the stores area to the machine. The comparator must know what coats to give to the various tablets when doing tablet coating. When

undertaking tablet printing the comparator must be able to set up the round plates in the machine. He must also have the ability to adjust the speed of the machine. At the end of the printing process the comparator must know how to strip down the machine.

***I find that the skills required of the comparator are greater than those required of the claimant.***

**Physical Effort:**

The claimant stands for much of her job. She lifts trays of viles and load them onto the vile/injection machine and she also lifts trays of bottles for the Lexion Powder machine. The claimant removes rubbish from the work area on a daily basis. She also undertakes a line clearance when changing from one batch to another.

In this job the comparator is constantly on his feet. When undertaking the pastes process the comparator must exert effort in scraping the mixture off the blades. He also must lift heavy bags of raw materials. When carrying out the powders process the comparator washes down the inside of the bucket with water. He also exerts physical effort in loading packs of powder product onto pallets. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator exerts physical effort in removing machine jams. He hoovers the machine and cleans the bowls after a batch is complete. When changing from different coloured tablets the comparator must clean down the machine thoroughly. During the granulations process the comparator must use physical effort to move product from the pallet and load it into the machine. He must empty bowls containing 150 kilo batch of product and he must scrape it out fully. The comparator must manually load the product from the bowls into drums using a sieve. While doing tablet coating the comparator is constantly moving between the various pans of tablets. After the tablet printing process is complete the comparator must strip down the machine.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of physical effort.***

**Mental Effort:**

The claimant monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly and that components e.g viles, syringes, caps, etc are being replenished constantly. The claimant checks weights and records the details of these checks. She completes an accountability report setting out the details of the components received at the start of the process, the amount used and the quantity being returned.

The comparator monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly. When working on the liquids process the comparator must ensure that the mixture is heated to the correct temperature. When carrying out the pastes process the comparator must monitor the temperature to ensure that it does not exceed 50°C. He must also review the ph test results so as to determine when the mix is ready. When undertaking the powders process the comparator must ensure that the preservative is completely dissolved in liquid. He must attempt to spread the mix evenly over the drums. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must ensure that the bowls of components are constantly replenished. He must check the boli to ensure that they are made up to specification e.g no broken tablets. The comparator constantly checks the sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. The comparator completes accountability reports for all the various processes he undertakes. When working on the granulations process the comparator checks the extraction level in the room. He monitors the mix to ensure that it contains no lumps and that it is mixed for a defined length of time. The comparator undertakes a test on the moisture content of the product. He updates the paperwork, performs line clearance and produces an accountability report. When doing tablet coating the comparator must know at what stage in the coating process are the various pans of tablets. He has to calculate the average weight of the drums of tablets at the end of the process. During the tablet printing process the comparator must monitor the speed at which the tablets are being printed and adjust, if necessary. He also has to monitor the print characteristics of the tablets.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator, in terms of mental effort, are higher than those made on the claimant.***

**Responsibility:**

The claimant is responsible for ensuring that the bowls on the Arenco Filling machine and on the Viles machine are correctly filled and she is responsible for replenishing them regularly.

She is also responsible for the samples she takes from the machines. The claimant is responsible for all the paperwork she completes throughout the process and she is also responsible for the accountability reports which she completes.

The comparator has responsibility for the process he undertakes and he must ensure that there is no product waste due to errors in the length of time a product should be mixed, etc. When placing stickers on products the comparator must ensure that the details on the stickers are correct. He is responsible for ensuring that the correct raw materials are added in the various processes. The comparator must ensure that he correctly logs process details and that his accountability reports at the end of the processes are accurate. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the proper quantities of product are added to the granulating process. He must ensure that the product is not too moist and that the powder flows freely i.e sufficient lubricant is added. He must also label the product correctly and ensure that all tests results are accurately recorded. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the tablets are properly coated. He must maintain a record of when the solution is added to the tablets and the length of time tablets were left to dry before the next solution was added. The comparator is also responsible for printing the tablets. He must ensure that they are printed properly. At the end of the process the comparator is responsible for striping down the machine and cleaning it properly.

***I am satisfied that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of responsibility.***

**Working Conditions:**

The claimant works in a sterile environment. She wears a special suit, shoes, gloves, ear muffs and surgical mask. The noise level in the sterile area is high.

The comparator works in different environments. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must wear earplugs as the noise levels are extremely high. During the pastes process the comparator must wear protective clothing e.g dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs. While working on the powders process the comparator changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and an airhood. At the end of the powders process the comparator is hosed down with pure water. During the granulation process the comparator must wear protective clothing because the

product is classified as dangerous. The atmosphere in which the comparator works when doing tablet coating is very dusty. He must wear protective clothing when putting a polishing coat on the tablets.

***Having balanced the demands made on both the claimant and the comparator, in terms of working conditions, I am satisfied that the demands made on the claimant are greater than those made on the comparator.***

## **Ms. Pauline Doyle (*Claimant*) vs Mr. Warren Neill (*Comparator*)**

### **Skill:**

The claimant operates a variety of machines. She must have the ability to perform weight checks on syringes, viles, etc depending on the machine she is operating. The claimant must know how to adjust the machine in the event that the weight checks are not acceptable and she must be constantly aware of what is or what is not acceptable weights for the various products i.e viles, syringes, etc. On the Arenco Filling machine and the vile/injection machine the claimant must know what components go into what bowls. In the event of a batch change the claimant must clean down the machines thoroughly.

The comparator operates a variety of machines for the purpose of undertaking different processes. In carrying out the liquids process the comparator must be able to properly adjust valves to dictate the way the product flows. He must connect up hoses from one tank to another when adding drugs to the mixture. The comparator must know how to use the control panel to undertake specific functions e.g circulation, heating, cooling, etc. In carrying out the pastes process the comparator must be able to add oil and other raw materials e.g preservative to the mixture. He must also know how to remove the bowl from the machine. In undertaking the powders process the comparator must know the correct quantities of the materials which should be added to the process. When packing the powder the comparator must ensure that the scales are correctly set within tolerance levels. The comparator must know how to make either of two types of boli when operating the PRB Assembly. He must know what components go into each specific bowl. The comparator must have the ability to free up any jams which result in the operation of the machine. He must also be able to operate a machine for re-work i.e boli which are rejected because, for example a tablet may be broken. The comparator must know how to manually input rejected boli into the machine so that they can be completed correctly. When the comparator is doing ready pulse boli he must know how to operate the initial separate sub-assembly machine. In carrying out the dispensing process the comparator must calculate the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require based on the quantities and batch of raw material being dispensed.

***I find that the skills required of the comparator are greater than those required of the claimant.***

### **Physical Effort:**

The claimant stands for much of her job. She lifts trays of viles and load them onto the vile/injection machine and she also lifts trays of bottles for the Lexion Powder machine. The claimant removes rubbish from the work area on a daily basis. She also undertakes a line clearance when changing from one batch to another.

In this job the comparator is constantly on his feet. When undertaking the pastes process the comparator must exert effort in scraping the mixture off the blades. He also must lift heavy bags of raw materials. When carrying out the powders process the comparator washes down the inside of the bucket with water. He also exerts physical effort in loading packs of powder product onto pallets. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator exerts physical effort in removing machine jams. He hoovers the machine and cleans the bowls after a batch is complete. When changing from different coloured tablets the comparator must clean down the machine thoroughly.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of physical effort.***

### **Mental Effort:**

The claimant monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly and that components e.g viles, syringes, caps, etc are being replenished constantly. The claimant checks weights and records the details of these checks. She also completes an accountability report setting out the details of the components received at the start of the process, the amount used and the quantity being returned.

The comparator monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly. When working on the liquids process the comparator must ensure that the mixture is heated to the correct temperature. When carrying out the pastes process the comparator must monitor the temperature to ensure that it does not exceed 50°C. He must also review the ph test results so as to determine when the mix is ready. When undertaking the powders process the comparator must ensure that the preservative is completely dissolved in liquid. He must attempt to spread the mix evenly over the drums. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must ensure that the bowls of components are constantly replenished. He must check the boli to ensure that they are made up to specification e.g no broken tablets. The comparator constantly checks the

sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. The comparator completes accountability reports for all the various processes he undertakes.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator, in terms of mental effort, are higher than those made on the claimant.***

### **Responsibility:**

The claimant is responsible for ensuring that the bowls on the Arenco Filling machine and on the Viles machine are correctly filled and she is responsible for replenishing them regularly. She is also responsible for the samples she takes from the machines. The claimant is responsible for all the paperwork she completes throughout the process and she is also responsible for the accountability reports which she completes.

The comparator has responsibility for the process he undertakes and he must ensure that there is no product waste due to errors in the length of time a product should be mixed, etc. When placing stickers on products the comparator must ensure that the details on the stickers are correct. He is responsible for ensuring that the correct raw materials are added in the various processes. The comparator must ensure that he correctly logs process details and that his accountability reports at the end of the processes are accurate.

***I am satisfied that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of responsibility.***

### **Working Conditions:**

The claimant works in a sterile environment. She wears a special suit, shoes, gloves, ear muffs and surgical mask. The noise level in the sterile area is high.

The comparator works in different environments. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must wear earplugs as the noise levels are extremely high. During the pastes process the comparator must wear protective clothing e.g dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs. While working on the powders process the comparator changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and an airhood. At the end of the powders process the comparator is hosed down with pure water.

***Having balanced the demands made on both the claimant and the comparator, in terms of working conditions, I am satisfied that the demands made on the claimant are greater than those made on the comparator.***

**APPENDIX G**

**Equality Officer's**

**Analysis**

**Ms. Elaine Crawford (*Claimant*) vs Mr. Martin Reilly  
(*Comparator*)**

**Skill:**

The claimant makes up solutions which are used by staff to disinfect their hands. She cleans the dressing rooms daily.

The comparator operates a variety of machines for the purpose of undertaking different processes. In carrying out the liquids process the comparator must be able to properly adjust valves to dictate the way the product flows. He must connect up hoses from one tank to another when adding drugs to the mixture. The comparator must know how to use the control panel to undertake specific functions e.g circulation, heating, cooling, etc. In carrying out the pastes process the comparator must be able to add oil and other raw materials e.g preservative to the mixture. He must also know how to remove the bowl from the machine. In undertaking the powders process the comparator must know the correct quantities of the materials which should be added to the process. When packing the powder the comparator must ensure that the scales are correctly set within tolerance levels. The comparator must know how to make either of two types of boli when operating the PRB Assembly. He must know what components go into each specific bowl. The comparator must have the ability to free up any jams which result in the operation of the machine. He must also be able to operate a machine for re-work i.e boli which are rejected because, for example a tablet may be broken. The comparator must know how to manually input rejected boli into the machine so that they can be completed correctly. When the comparator is doing ready pulse boli he must know how to operate the initial separate sub-assembly machine. In carrying out the dispensing process the comparator must calculate the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require based on the quantities and batch of raw material being dispensed. To undertake the granulation process the comparator must be able to use various pieces of equipment e.g mobile pump tank, mixer, dryer, etc. He must also have the ability to use a forklift truck to take pallets of product from the stores area to the machine. The comparator must know what coats to give to the various tablets when doing tablet coating. When undertaking tablet printing the comparator must be able to set up the round plates in the machine. He must also have the ability to adjust the speed of the machine. At the end of the printing process the comparator must know how to strip down the machine. When undertaking compression the comparator must know how to put the various dyes (i.e pieces of equipment) into the machine. He must know the height at which to set the hopper. This

skill is acquired through experience. The comparator has to connect a plastic tube and a deduster to the machine. He sets up the extraction in the roof. In the compression process the comparator must perform a number of tests on the tablets and then adjust the machine, if necessary. At the end of the compression process the comparator must weigh every tablet for the last 500 grams in the feed frame. He uses a pallet truck to move the pallets containing drums of product to the warehouse. The comparator must be able to remove all the pins, dyes, punches and cams from the machines. He must clean them and ensure that they do not hit up against each other otherwise they can be damaged. The comparator must be able to repair damaged tools, where possible.

***I find that the skills required of the comparator are greater than those required of the claimant.***

### **Physical Effort**

The claimant exerts physical effort in cleaning the dressing rooms. She has to pile up supplies on trolleys and bring them from the storage area to the Sterile area. The claimant has to lift bags of laundry.

In this job the comparator is constantly on his feet. When undertaking the pastes process the comparator must exert effort in scraping the mixture off the blades. He also must lift heavy bags of raw materials. When carrying out the powders process the comparator washes down the inside of the bucket with water. He also exerts physical effort in loading packs of powder product onto pallets. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator exerts physical effort in removing machine jams. He hovers the machine and cleans the bowls after a batch is complete. When changing from different coloured tablets the comparator must clean down the machine thoroughly. During the granulations process the comparator must use physical effort to move product from the pallet and load it into the machine. He must empty bowls containing 150 kilo batch of product and he must scrape it out fully. The comparator must manually load the product from the bowls into drums using a sieve. While doing tablet coating the comparator is constantly moving between the various pans of tablets. After the tablet printing process is complete the comparator must strip down the machine. During the compression process the comparator exerts physical effort in setting up and dismantling the machine. He lifts drums of tablets onto pallets and uses a pallet truck to move them to the warehouse.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of physical effort.***

**Mental Effort.**

The claimant constantly monitors supplies and either orders more or gets more from stores, when necessary.

The comparator monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly. When working on the liquids process the comparator must ensure that the mixture is heated to the correct temperature. When carrying out the pastes process the comparator must monitor the temperature to ensure that it does not exceed 50°C. He must also review the ph test results so as to determine when the mix is ready. When undertaking the powders process the comparator must ensure that the preservative is completely dissolved in liquid. He must attempt to spread the mix evenly over the drums. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must ensure that the bowls of components are constantly replenished. He must check the boli to ensure that they are made up to specification e.g no broken tablets. The comparator constantly checks the sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. The comparator completes accountability reports for all the various processes he undertakes. When working on the granulations process the comparator checks the extraction level in the room. He monitors the mix to ensure that it contains no lumps and that it is mixed for a defined length of time. The comparator undertakes a test on the moisture content of the product. He updates the paperwork, performs line clearance and produces an accountability report. When doing tablet coating the comparator must know at what stage in the coating process are the various pans of tablets. He has to calculate the average weight of the drums of tablets at the end of the process. During the tablet printing process the comparator must monitor the speed at which the tablets are being printed and adjust, if necessary. He also has to monitor the print characteristics of the tablets. When undertaking the compression process the comparator must ensure that he puts in the various pieces of equipment into the machine correctly. He must ensure that the paperwork (e.g test result bgs) is up-to-date and accurate. The comparator must ensure that the facing of the tools which emboss the tablets are very clean. At the end of the compression process the comparator must calculate the total amount of tablets produced.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator, in terms of mental effort, are higher than those made on the claimant.***

**Responsibility:**

The claimant is responsible for ensuring that there is always a supply of solutions made up for staff to disinfect their hands. She is also responsible for ensuring that there are sufficient supplies available in the Sterile area and for re-ordering supplies as appropriate.

The comparator has responsibility for the processes he undertakes and he must ensure that there is no product waste due to errors in the length of time a product should be mixed, etc. When placing stickers on products the comparator must ensure that the details on the stickers are correct. He is responsible for ensuring that the correct raw materials are added in the various processes. The comparator must ensure that he correctly logs process details and that his accountability reports at the end of the processes are accurate. In the granulating process the comparator must ensure that the product is not too moist and that the powder flows freely i.e sufficient lubricant is added. He must also label the product correctly and ensure that all tests results are accurately recorded. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the tablets are properly coated. He must maintain a record of when the solution is added to the tablets and the length of time tablets were left to dry before the next solution was added. The comparator is also responsible for printing the tablets. He must ensure that they are printed properly. At the end of the process the comparator is responsible for stripping down the machine and cleaning it properly. When undertaking the compression process the comparator is responsible for setting up the machine properly. He must verify that the granulated powder has passed quarantine. During compression the comparator is responsible for ensuring that all tests are performed, results recorded and machines adjusted as necessary. He must ensure that drums are properly labelled. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the various tools (e.g bits, cams, punches, etc) are clean and not damaged. He is responsible for repairing any damaged tools.

***I am satisfied that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of responsibility.***

**Working Conditions:**

Throughout her working day the claimant moves in and out of the sterile area. She wears a special suit, shoes, gloves, ear muffs and surgical mask when in the Sterile area. The noise level in the sterile area is high.

The comparator works in different environments. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must wear earplugs as the noise levels are extremely high. During the pastes process the comparator must wear protective clothing e.g dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs. While working on the powders process the comparator changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and an airhood. At the end of the powders process the comparator is hosed down with pure water. During the granulation process the comparator must wear protective clothing because the product is classified as dangerous.

***Having balanced the demands made on both the claimant and the comparator, in terms of working conditions, I am satisfied that the demands made on the claimant are equal to those made on the comparator.***

**Ms. Elaine Crawford (*Claimant*) vs Mr. Philip Byrne  
(*Comparator*)**

**Skill:**

The claimant makes up solutions which are used by staff to disinfect their hands. She cleans the dressing rooms daily.

The comparator operates a variety of machines for the purpose of undertaking different processes. In carrying out the liquids process the comparator must be able to properly adjust valves to dictate the way the product flows. He must connect up hoses from one tank to another when adding drugs to the mixture. The comparator must know how to use the control panel to undertake specific functions e.g circulation, heating, cooling, etc. In carrying out the pastes process the comparator must be able to add oil and other raw materials e.g preservative to the mixture. He must also know how to remove the bowl from the machine. In undertaking the powders process the comparator must know the correct quantities of the materials which should be added to the process. When packing the powder the comparator must ensure that the scales are correctly set within tolerance levels. The comparator must know how to make either of two types of boli when operating the PRB Assembly. He must know what components go into each specific bowl. The comparator must have the ability to free up any jams which result in the operation of the machine. He must also be able to operate a machine for re-work i.e boli which are rejected because, for example a tablet may be broken. The comparator must know how to manually input rejected boli into the machine so that they can be completed correctly. When the comparator is doing ready pulse boli he must know how to operate the initial separate sub-assembly machine. In carrying out the dispensing process the comparator must calculate the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require based on the quantities and batch of raw material being dispensed. To undertake the granulation process the comparator must be able to use various pieces of equipment e.g mobile pump tank, mixer, dryer, etc. He must also have the ability to use a forklift truck to take pallets of product from the stores area to the machine. When undertaking compression the comparator must know how to put the various dyes (i.e pieces of equipment) into the machine. He must know the height at which to set the hopper. This skill is acquired through experience. The comparator has to connect a plastic tube and a deduster to the machine. He sets up the extraction in the roof. In the compression process the comparator must perform a number of tests on the tablets and then adjust the machine, if necessary. At the end of the compression process the comparator must weigh every tablet

for the last 500 grams in the feed frame. He uses a pallet truck to move the pallets containing drums of product to the warehouse. The comparator must be able to remove all the pins, dyes, punches and cams from the machines. He must clean them and ensure that they do not hit up against each other otherwise they can be damaged. The comparator must be able to repair damaged tools, where possible.

***I find that the skills required of the comparator are greater than those required of the claimant.***

### **Physical Effort**

The claimant exerts physical effort in cleaning the dressing rooms. She has to pile up supplies on trolleys and bring them from the storage area to the Sterile area. The claimant has to lift bags of laundry.

In this job the comparator is constantly on his feet. When undertaking the pastes process the comparator must exert effort in scraping the mixture off the blades. He also must lift heavy bags of raw materials. When carrying out the powders process the comparator washes down the inside of the bucket with water. He also exerts physical effort in loading packs of powder product onto pallets. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator exerts physical effort in removing machine jams. He hoovers the machine and cleans the bowls after a batch is complete. When changing from different coloured tablets the comparator must clean down the machine thoroughly. During the granulations process the comparator must use physical effort to move product from the pallet and load it into the machine. He must empty bowls containing 150 kilo batch of product and he must scrape it out fully. The comparator must manually load the product from the bowls into drums using a sieve. During the compression process the comparator exerts physical effort in setting up and dismantling the machine. He lifts drums of tablets onto pallets and uses a pallet truck to move them to the warehouse.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of physical effort.***

### **Mental Effort**

The claimant constantly monitors supplies and either orders more or gets more from stores, when necessary.

The comparator monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly. When working on the liquids process the comparator must ensure that the mixture is heated to the correct temperature. When carrying out the pastes process the comparator must monitor the temperature to ensure that it does not exceed 50°C. He must also review the ph test results so as to determine when the mix is ready. When undertaking the powders process the comparator must ensure that the preservative is completely dissolved in liquid. He must attempt to spread the mix evenly over the drums. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must ensure that the bowls of components are constantly replenished. He must check the boli to ensure that they are made up to specification e.g no broken tablets. The comparator constantly checks the sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. The comparator completes accountability reports for all the various processes he undertakes. When working on the granulations process the comparator checks the extraction level in the room. He monitors the mix to ensure that it contains no lumps and that it is mixed for a defined length of time. The comparator undertakes a test on the moisture content of the product. He updates the paperwork, performs line clearance and produces an accountability report. When undertaking the compression process the comparator must ensure that he puts in hte various pieces of equipment into the machine correctly. He must ensure that the paperwork (e.g test result logs) is up-to-date and accurate. The comparator must ensure that the facing of the tools which emboss the tablets are very clean. At the end of the compression process the comparator must calculate the total amount of tablets produced.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator, in terms of mental effort, are higher than those made on the claimant.***

### **Responsibility:**

The claimant is responsible for ensuring that there is always a supply of solutions made up for staff to disinfect their hands. She is also responsible for ensuring that there are sufficient supplies available in the Sterile area and for re-ordering supplies as appropriate.

The comparator has responsibility for the processes he undertakes and he must ensure that there is no product waste due to errors in the length of time a product should be mixed, etc. When placing stickers on products the comparator must ensure that the details on the stickers are correct. He is responsible for ensuring that the correct raw materials are added in the various processes. The comparator must ensure that he correctly logs process details and that his accountability reports at the end of the processes are accurate. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the proper quantities of product are added to the granulating process. He must ensure that the product is not too moist and that the powder flows freely i.e sufficient lubricant is added. He must also label the product correctly and ensure that all tests results are accurately recorded. When undertaking the compression process the comparator is responsible for setting up the machine properly. He must verify that the granulated powder has passed quarantine. During compression the comparator is responsible for ensuring that all tests are performed, results recorded and machines adjusted as necessary. He must ensure that drums are properly labelled. The comparator is responsible for ensuring that the various tools (e.g bits, cams, punches, etc) are clean and not damaged. He is responsible for repairing any damaged tools.

***I am satisfied that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of responsibility.***

**Working Conditions:**

Throughout her working day the claimant moves in and out of the sterile area. She wears a special suit, shoes, gloves, ear muffs and surgical mask when in the Sterile area. The noise level in the sterile area is high.

The comparator works in different environments. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must wear earplugs as the noise levels are extremely high. During the pastes process the comparator must wear protective clothing e.g dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs. While working on the powders process the comparator changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and an

airhood. At the end of the powders process the comparator is hosed down with pure water. During the granulation process the comparator must wear protective clothing because the product is classified as dangerous. The atmosphere in which the comparator works when doing tablet coating is very dusty. He must wear protective clothing when putting a polishing coat on the tablets.

***Having balanced the demands made on both the claimant and the comparator, in terms of working conditions, I am satisfied that the demands made on the claimant are equal to those made on the comparator.***

**Ms. Elaine Crawford (*Claimant*) vs Mr. Steven Hayden  
(*Comparator*)**

**Skill:**

The claimant makes up solutions which are used by staff to disinfect their hands. She cleans the dressing rooms daily.

The comparator operates a variety of machines for the purpose of undertaking different processes. In carrying out the liquids process the comparator must be able to properly adjust valves to dictate the way the product flows. He must connect up hoses from one tank to another when adding drugs to the mixture. The comparator must know how to use the control panel to undertake specific functions e.g circulation, heating, cooling, etc. In carrying out the pastes process the comparator must be able to add oil and other raw materials e.g preservative to the mixture. He must also know how to remove the bowl from the machine. In undertaking the powders process the comparator must know the correct quantities of the materials which should be added to the process. When packing the powder the comparator must ensure that the scales are correctly set within tolerance levels. The comparator must know how to make either of two types of boli when operating the PRB Assembly. He must know what components go into each specific bowl. The comparator must have the ability to free up any jams which result in the operation of the machine. He must also be able to operate a machine for re-work i.e boli which are rejected because, for example a tablet may be broken. The comparator must know how to manually input rejected boli into the machine so that they can be completed correctly. When the comparator is doing ready pulse boli he must know how to operate the initial separate sub-assembly machine. In carrying out the dispensing process the comparator must calculate the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require based on the quantities and batch of raw material being dispensed. To undertake the granulation process the comparator must be able to use various pieces of equipment e.g mobile pump tank, mixer, dryer, etc. He must also have the ability to use a forklift truck to take pallets of product from the stores area to the machine. The comparator must know what coats to give to the various tablets when doing tablet coating. When undertaking tablet printing the comparator must be able to set up the round plates in the machine. He must also have the ability to adjust the speed of the machine. At the end of the printing process the comparator must know how to strip down the machine.

***I find that the skills required of the comparator are greater than those required of the claimant.***

**Physical Effort.**

The claimant exerts physical effort in cleaning the dressing rooms. She has to pile up supplies on trolleys and bring them from the storage area to the Sterile area. The claimant has to lift bags of laundry.

In this job the comparator is constantly on his feet. When undertaking the pastes process the comparator must exert effort in scraping the mixture off the blades. He also must lift heavy bags of raw materials. When carrying out the powders process the comparator washes down the inside of the bucket with water. He also exerts physical effort in loading packs of powder product onto pallets. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator exerts physical effort in removing machine jams. He hoovers the machine and cleans the bowls after a batch is complete. When changing from different coloured tablets the comparator must clean down the machine thoroughly. During the granulations process the comparator must use physical effort to move product from the pallet and load it into the machine. He must empty bowls containing 150 kilo batch of product and he must scrape it out fully. The comparator must manually load the product from the bowls into drums using a sieve. While doing tablet coating the comparator is constantly moving between the various pans of tablets. After the tablet printing process is complete the comparator must strip down the machine.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of physical effort.***

**Mental Effort.**

The claimant constantly monitors supplies and either orders more or gets more from stores, when necessary.

The comparator monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly. When working on the liquids process the comparator must ensure that the mixture is heated to the correct temperature. When carrying out the pastes process the comparator must monitor the temperature to ensure that it does not exceed

50°C. He must also review the ph test results so as to determine when the mix is ready. When undertaking the powders process the comparator must ensure that the preservative is completely dissolved in liquid. He must attempt to spread the mix evenly over the drums. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must ensure that the bowls of components are constantly replenished. He must check the boli to ensure that they are made up to specification e.g no broken tablets. The comparator constantly checks the sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. The comparator completes accountability reports for all the various processes he undertakes. When working on the granulations process the comparator checks the extraction level in the room. He monitors the mix to ensure that it contains no lumps and that it is mixed for a defined length of time. The comparator undertakes a test on the moisture content of the product. He updates the paperwork, performs line clearance and produces an accountability report. When doing tablet coating the comparator must know at what stage in the coating process are the various pans of tablets. He has to calculate the average weight of the drums of tablets at the end of the process. During the tablet printing process the comparator must monitor the speed at which the tablets are being printed and adjust, if necessary. He also has to monitor the print characteristics of the tablets.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator, in terms of mental effort, are higher than those made on the claimant.***

### **Responsibility:**

The claimant is responsible for ensuring that there is always a supply of solutions made up for staff to disinfect their hands. She is also responsible for ensuring that there are sufficient supplies available in the Sterile area and for re-ordering supplies as appropriate.

The comparator has responsibility for the processes he undertakes and he must ensure that there is no product waste due to errors in the length of time a product should be mixed, etc. When placing stickers on products the comparator must ensure that the details on the stickers are correct. He is responsible for ensuring that the correct raw materials are added in the various processes. The comparator must ensure that he correctly logs process details and that his accountability reports at the end of the processes are accurate. In the granulating process the comparator must ensure that the product is not too moist and that the powder flows freely i.e sufficient lubricant is added. He must also label the product correctly and ensure that all tests results are accurately recorded. The comparator is

responsible for ensuring that the tablets are properly coated. He must maintain a record of when the solution is added to the tablets and the length of time tablets were left to dry before the next solution was added. The comparator is also responsible for printing the tablets. He must ensure that they are printed properly. At the end of the process the comparator is responsible for stripping down the machine and cleaning it properly. He also undertakes an accountability report.

***I am satisfied that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of responsibility.***

**Working Conditions:**

Throughout her working day the claimant moves in and out of the sterile area. She wears a special suit, shoes, gloves, ear muffs and surgical mask when in the Sterile area. The noise level in the sterile area is high.

The comparator works in different environments. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must wear earplugs as the noise levels are extremely high. During the pastes process the comparator must wear protective clothing e.g dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs. While working on the powders process the comparator changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and an airhood. At the end of the powders process the comparator is hosed down with pure water. During the granulation process the comparator must wear protective clothing because the product is classified as dangerous. The atmosphere in which the comparator works when doing tablet coating is very dusty. He must wear protective clothing when putting a polishing coat on the tablets.

***Having balanced the demands made on both the claimant and the comparator, in terms of working conditions, I am satisfied that the demands made on the claimant are equal to those made on the comparator.***

**Ms. Elaine Crawford (Claimant) vs Mr. Warren Neill  
(Comparator)**

**Skill:**

The claimant makes up solutions which are used by staff to disinfect their hands. She cleans the dressing rooms daily.

The comparator operates a variety of machines for the purpose of undertaking different processes. In carrying out the liquids process the comparator must be able to properly adjust valves to dictate the way the product flows. He must connect up hoses from one tank to another when adding drugs to the mixture. The comparator must know how to use the control panel to undertake specific functions e.g circulation, heating, cooling, etc. In carrying out the pastes process the comparator must be able to add oil and other raw materials e.g preservative to the mixture. He must also know how to remove the bowl from the machine. In undertaking the powders process the comparator must know the correct quantities of the materials which should be added to the process. When packing the powder the comparator must ensure that the scales are correctly set within tolerance levels. The comparator must know how to make either of two types of boli when operating the PRB Assembly. He must know what components go into each specific bowl. The comparator must have the ability to free up any jams which result in the operation of the machine. He must also be able to operate a machine for re-work i.e boli which are rejected because, for example a tablet may be broken. The comparator must know how to manually input rejected boli into the machine so that they can be completed correctly. When the comparator is doing ready pulse boli he must know how to operate the initial separate sub-assembly machine. In carrying out the dispensing process the comparator must calculate the number of drums, bags and scoops he will require based on the quantities and batch of raw material being dispensed.

***I find that the skills required of the comparator are greater than those required of the claimant.***

**Physical Effort**

The claimant exerts physical effort in cleaning the dressing rooms. She has to pile up supplies on trolleys and bring them from the storage area to the Sterile area. The claimant has to lift bags of laundry.

In this job the comparator is constantly on his feet. When undertaking the pastes process the comparator must exert effort in scraping the mixture off the blades. He also must lift heavy bags of raw materials. When carrying out the powders process the comparator washes down the inside of the bucket with water. He also exerts physical effort in loading packs of powder product onto pallets. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator exerts physical effort in removing machine jams. He hovers the machine and cleans the bowls after a batch is complete. When changing from different coloured tablets the comparator must clean down the machine thoroughly.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of physical effort.***

### **Mental Effort:**

The claimant constantly monitors supplies and either orders more or gets more from stores, when necessary.

The comparator monitors the operation of the various machines to ensure that they are working efficiently and correctly. When working on the liquids process the comparator must ensure that the mixture is heated to the correct temperature. When carrying out the pastes process the comparator must monitor the temperature to ensure that it does not exceed 50°C. He must also review the ph test results so as to determine when the mix is ready. When undertaking the powders process the comparator must ensure that the preservative is completely dissolved in liquid. He must attempt to spread the mix evenly over the drums. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must ensure that the bowls of components are constantly replenished. He must check the boli to ensure that they are made up to specification e.g no broken tablets. The comparator constantly checks the sensors to ensure that they are free from dust. The comparator completes accountability reports for all the various processes he undertakes.

***I find that the demands made on the comparator, in terms of mental effort, are higher than those made on the claimant.***

### **Responsibility:**

The claimant is responsible for ensuring that there is always a supply of solutions made up for staff to disinfect their hands. She is also responsible for ensuring that there are sufficient supplies available in the Sterile area and for re-ordering supplies as appropriate.

The comparator has responsibility for the process he undertakes and he must ensure that there is no product waste due to errors in the length of time a product should be mixed, etc. When placing stickers on products the comparator must ensure that the details on the stickers are correct. He is responsible for ensuring that the correct raw materials are added in the various processes. The comparator must ensure that he correctly logs process details and that his accountability reports at the end of the processes are accurate.

***I am satisfied that the demands made on the comparator are greater than those made on the claimant in terms of responsibility.***

**Working Conditions:**

Throughout her working day the claimant moves in and out of the sterile area. She wears a special suit, shoes, gloves, ear muffs and surgical mask when in the Sterile area. The noise level in the sterile area is high.

The comparator works in different environments. When working on the PRB Assembly the comparator must wear earplugs as the noise levels are extremely high. During the pastes process the comparator must wear protective clothing e.g dust mask, glasses, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and ear muffs. While working on the powders process the comparator changes into protective clothing namely a special suit, two pairs of gloves, overshoes and an airhood. At the end of the powders process the comparator is hosed down with pure water.

***Having balanced the demands made on both the claimant and the comparator, in terms of working conditions, I am satisfied that the demands made on the claimant are equal to those made on the comparator.***